16. Wolfe 1987, Compatibilism and sanity

Kevin Dorst
kevindorst@pitt.edu

PHIL 0450

Frankfurt: your will is free if you're in the right sort of mental state: you *identify with* your action, rather than being *alienated from* it.

You identify with your action A if it's consistent with your *volitions*, i.e. if you want your desire to A to be effective.

As Wolfe says: if your action comes from your *deep self*—the way you want yourself to be.

This is a *compatibilist* theory, since even if external forces determined what your deep self is, it is still *your* deep self—and that's what matters for responsibility.

Objection from below: Can we identify with our first-order desires, and be alienated from our second-order ones?

Huckleberry Finn

Objection from above: Can we identify with our *third*-order desires, and be alienated from our second-order ones?

The lapsed Catholic

Perhaps we could refine the notion of "deep self" to avoid these objections. Even if we do, Wolfe thinks there's a problem with the approach.

Wolfe: People can *identify with* their actions—their actions can flow from their deep self—without being *responsible for* them.

> **Dictator.** Dick is raised to be a dictator by his evil father. He learns to regularly imprison, torture, and kill people on mere whims, and to suppress dissent and freedom completely. This is what his deep self wants! He comes to identify with, and want to be, the sort of person who does such things.

Wolfe: Dick shouldn't be held responsible for his actions—not because he can't control his deep self, but because his deep self is not *sane*.

You are *sane* if (1) you know what you're doing, and (2) you know whether what you're doing is right or wrong.

Not quite the ordinary notion, but similar to it. In ordinary life, we think people who are untethered from reality are not morally responsible for their actions, while those who are tethered to it are responsible.

No one ever thought it's up to us whether we're sane! Still, it intuitively matters for responsibility.

Wolfe: your action is free (you are morally responsible for it) if (i) it comes from your deep self, and (ii) your deep self is *sane*, knowing the difference between right and wrong.

What matters for responsibility?	van Inwagen: self-*creation*
	Frankfurt: self-*revision*
	Wolfe: self-*correction*

Worry for all compatibilists: the *freedom gun*.